

Author/ year/ journal/ page length ⁱ	Area	Policy, duration	Use of MSA concepts	Attempt to ‘test hypotheses’ (or otherwise operationalise MSA)? Method of analysis?
National Studies (20)				
Avery (2004) <i>Public Administration Review</i> , 14	US	Bioterror, public health	Low (or largely implicit)	No. A policy narrative based on documentary analysis.
<p><i>Summary of relevant discussions.</i> Kingdon’s language is in the title, and the article gives some advice to practitioners about waiting for the right time, or window of opportunity, to propose policy solutions. There is a brief focus on the role of policy entrepreneurs and the acceptability of certain policy solutions (which ties in with Kingdon’s emphasis on technical feasibility). There is a discussion of relevant country specific issues (shared powers between federal and state governments) and universal issues (disease spread can be defined primarily as security or public health problems; a policy is only a statement until implemented). Also discusses, briefly, the implementation literature.</p>				
Bache and Reardon (2013), <i>Political Studies</i> , 17	UK (in the EU)	Wellbeing – measurement (8 measures including material, health, education and environment) and policy action	High	No (yes). Uses interview (30) and documentary analysis
<p>Outlines the role of MSA (briefly as part of a wider focus on agenda setting) and uses discussion of the three streams to structure the conceptual discussion – and suggest that a coupling has not yet taken place, given the low attention to wellbeing and a tendency to frame policies primarily in economic, not wellbeing, terms (bar, perhaps, in areas such as mental health – but even then, Layard’s push for CBT expansion is often justified in economic terms). Argues that Kingdon’s original work did not appreciate the role of <i>transnational</i> policy communities as sources of ideas, and the role of supranational and subnational government, either because of his focus (US domestic) or time (1980s, before the rising importance of policy transfer). Potential links with Cairney (on the link between the transfer of ideas from outside the UK and the window of opportunity to become receptive to them in subnational government) and Liu et al (2011) and McLendon (2003) on sub-national US policy, in which ideas come from other states or federal level.</p>				
Birkland	US	Terrorism,	High	No (Yes). Narrative based on

(2004) <i>Review of Policy Research</i> , 22		security, 18 months		quantitative analysis of media and congressional attention (more akin to PET?), plus documentary analysis on policy change.
<p>Outlines Kingdon's 'streams metaphor', identifying the role of three streams, and uses key MSA insights – high attention does not produce new solutions, or cause policy change; established solutions, chasing problems, are much more likely to be adopted than new ones – to inform case studies. Terrorism responses had been discussed for some time in Congress, and 9/11 helped open a window of opportunity for advocates of 'preexisting' policies to strengthen security measures. Previous terror-related air disasters had also opened up successive windows of opportunity for incremental changes towards stronger airport security. There is also a focus on the broad agenda setting literature and passing reference to SCTP and PET. Demonstrates a strong appreciation of the agenda setting (and policy theory) literature.</p>				
Brunner (2008) <i>Global Environmental Change</i> , 7	Germany	Environment, emissions trading, focus on major change in less than a year	High	No (yes). Uses interviews and documentary analysis to explain key a policy change in a short space of time.
<p>Uses MSA to structure the research and explain the results, with sections on problems, policies and politics. Highlights limitations of MSA, in relation to (a) the differences between the US and EU (as a supranational body), and (b) differences in the ability to venue shop. Suggests a multiple-theoretical approach to provide a full explanation of the case – by, in this case, drawing on PET to discuss venue shopping. Shows an appreciation of the role of other policy theories and how the MSA might relate to them.</p>				
Cairney (2009), <i>Journal of European Public Policy</i> , 19	UK (and EU)	Tobacco, focus on major change over several years	High, albeit focusing mainly on two streams	No (yes). Uses interviews and documentary analysis to explain a key policy change in a short space of time
<p>Argues that the 'organised anarchy' of the EU makes it appropriate to study with garbage can and MSA models, and that the 'universal' elements of MSA make it applicable to individual member states. Identifies four separate windows of opportunity to make change in the same policy (in 4 governments – UK, Scottish, Welsh, Northern Ireland – in the UK), to demonstrate the importance of the politics stream, or different levels of receptivity to the same policy solution. Uses MSA to inform the analysis of 'policy transfer', to show that an identification of the wide spread of the same policy solution is incomplete without considering how and why each government imported it. Shows an appreciation of the role of other policy</p>				

theories and how the MSA might relate to them.

Chen (2008), <i>Transportation Law Journal</i> , 28	US	Transport, high speed rail, combination of history and vignette	High	No (yes). A policy narrative based on documentary analysis.
---	----	--	------	---

In one respect, the strongest example of taking Kingdon’s lead, focusing on a similar policy area studies by Kingdon in the US over a similar time period (a combination of vignette and decades-long history) – but based on documentary analysis and no interviews. Separates the discussion into sections on problems, policies and politics, coupling and entrepreneurs. No discussion of other policy theory.

Howie (2009), <i>The Journal for Nurse Practitioners</i> , 6	US	Health, medical malpractice regulation, focuses on the future	Medium	No. Uses MSA as a way to recommend certain policy changes, not study the process.
---	----	--	--------	--

Attempts to use MSA to predict the right time to exploit a window of opportunity to introduce regulations to make it mandatory to report medical errors and ‘near misses’. Outlines the three streams, but does not engage with the messy nature of policymaking or use Kingdon’s insights to help explain the policy process (although some of the discussion is about technical feasibility). Instead, uses the streams metaphor to advocate policy change, often giving the impression that it is a more ‘rational’ process than MSA suggests.

Howlett (1998), <i>Canadian Journal of Political Science</i> , 30	Canada	Multiple issues: Native affairs, the constitution, drug abuse, acid rain, the nuclear industry and capital punishment	Very high	Yes. Seeks to clarify MSA by categorising, for example, types of open windows, and testing the hypothesis that regular ‘institutionalised’ windows are more frequent than others. Uses quantitative data (perhaps closer to the PET focus on media and legislative attention).
---	--------	--	--------------	---

To determine if MSA is applicable to Canada, Howlett tests the hypothesis (related to Kingdon’s expectation of the US system), and confirms with selected data, that ‘*routine political windows*, in which institutionalized procedural events dictate predictable window openings’ are more frequent than, ‘*discretionary political windows*, in which the behaviour of individual political actors lead to less predictable window openings; *spillover problem*

windows, in which related issues are drawn into an already open window; and *random problem windows*, in which random events or crises open unpredictable windows’.

Keeler (1993), <i>Comparative Political Studies</i> , 54	US, France, UK	Major government reforms, including New Deal, UK privatisation, France’s Social Experiment	Low	No (yes). Uses formulae and quantitative data to define and measure the size of policy windows.
---	----------------	--	-----	---

Tries to explain the opening of a ‘macro window’, where a window opens for sustained major change over an unusually long period to allow major reform programmes. Possible explanations include an electoral landslide victory, which raises expectations for a party with control of the legislature to reform policy, and/or a severe crisis that prompts policymakers to act urgently and extensively. Identifies enormous, large, medium and small windows. The reference to Kingdon is cursory, and streams are not used to guide the research. However, Keeler raises an interesting question about the nature of change that occurs when windows open, from the adoption of one solution to a whole reform programme.

Lieberman (2002a), <i>American Political Science Review</i> , 16	US	Civil rights, 1960s and 1970s	Medium	No. Uses documentary analysis and literature reviews to conceptualise the role of ideas and institutions in policy change.
---	----	-------------------------------	--------	--

An example of an article that cites Kingdon as part of a wide-ranging conceptual discussion on the role of ideas and institutions in explanations of policy change (note the reference to Hall and to a small number of studies of complexity). Makes use of key concepts (receptivity to solutions in the political stream) to make Kingdonesque points without an exposition of the streams/ windows language: “At those moments when a political idea finds persuasive expression among actors whose institutional position gives them both the motive and the opportunity to translate it into policy—then, and only then, can we say that an idea has found a time”.

Lober (1997), <i>Policy Sciences</i> , 24	US	Environment, paper procurement, 1993	High	No (yes). Uses a case study to develop 5 MSA-related propositions. Interviews and documentary analysis to explain a policy window for government/ private sector
--	----	--------------------------------------	------	--

				collaboration.
<p>Draws on Gray and Kingdon to describe a window of opportunity for (voluntary) private company cooperation with government, in a field characterised by ambiguity (regarding the nature of the problem), imbalances of power and scientific uncertainty. Identifies four streams, but 3 and 4 are elements of the politics stream (receptivity in organisations, prompted by environmental concerns and timely investment in new paper technology, plus a conducive or assertive national mood), separated to reflect the need to explain why private firms would cooperate. Develops 5 ‘propositions’ or requirements for collaboration: heightened awareness (prompted by scientific or public concern), solutions that do not depart radically from current practice, a desire by companies to ‘green’ their image, public pressure for change, and an entrepreneur to bring people together.</p>				
Mazarr (2007), <i>Foreign Policy Analysis</i> , 23	US	Foreign policy, Iraq war (and 10 year lead up)	High	No (yes). Uses interviews and documentary analysis to identify the Iraq War ‘solution’ chasing problems.
<p>An example of a strong application of Kingdon’s book (alongside a wider appreciation of agenda setting and social construction). Detailed analysis of the development of an Iraq War policy over many years, with key entrepreneurs operating in the policy community to ‘soften up’ others to this solution, and waiting for the right time to propose it. Focuses on the non-incremental nature of policy, as a problem arises quickly, a solution exists (and no other solution was sought), and policymakers have the motive and opportunity to select it.</p>				
Natali (2004), <i>Journal of European Public Policy</i> , 19	Italy	Welfare state reform, 1992-5 (compared to 1980s)	Medium	No (yes – <u>unusually focused on operationalising propositions</u>). Tries to create a new model to address vagueness of MSA; to provide clearer dependent and independent variables. Documentary analysis.
<p>An example of a weak application of Kingdon’s book, with no real exposition of the three streams or use of MSA to structure the analysis. Instead, it highlights the vague/ metaphorical nature of MSA and seeks to draw on a wider literature (e.g. that on path dependence/ departure) to produce an alternative model. A very detailed case study, which focuses primarily on identifying a large number of causes of change, using the language of ‘policy windows’ throughout.</p>				
Pralle (2009), <i>Environmental Politics</i> , 19	US, but with a discussion of the global response	Environment, climate change, future	High	No. Uses MSA and agenda setting literature to give advice on how to keep problems on the agenda and

				pursue particular solutions (rather than explain policy change).
An example of an article that seeks to use policy theory insights, in a sophisticated way, to give advice on how scientists and advocates should act to influence the policy process. There is a strong appreciation of MSA, and how it fits into the agenda setting literature, to advise how to define problems and maintain attention, present well-formed solutions, and encourage policymaker receptivity. Drawing on PET, Pralle also adds the importance of venue shopping.				
Saint-Germain and Calamia (1996), <i>Journal of Criminal Justice</i> , 14	US	Crime, 'three strikes' law, 1980s history and 1994 vignette	High	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis and small number of interviews to explain the adoption of a high profile law.
One of several articles that uses MSA to highlight incremental change (when others use it to explain a major shift during a window). The 3 strikes law shows continuity with the past, largely because policy solutions developed gradually in one stream, and coupled with the problems and politics streams when the US President acted on public concerns over crime. Reference to Hayes on incrementalism, but limited discussion of the wider literature,				
Scheberle (1994), <i>Policy Studies Journal</i> , 14	US	Environment, public health, health & safety, radon and asbestos	Medium	No. Uses documentary analysis to explain the rise of two issues on the public agenda.
Adapts work by Kingdon and Stone (1989) to explain why public, media and government attention to radon and asbestos, as carcinogenic materials, rose over time – and discusses the role of entrepreneurs in raising issues, but does not use the streams approach to structure and explain change or track developments in the policy stream (although the study could be extended to that end).				
Sharma (2008), <i>Social Policy and Society</i> , 13	India	Crime and 'non-normative sexual activities', history and vignette (1994-2006)	Medium	No. Uses documentary analysis to trace attention to an issue over time.
The main focus is on the role of HIV in helping people reframe a law on penetrative sex. MSA is the main reference point for this focus on agenda setting, and the three Ps are used to provide article headings, but the reference to MSA is superficial and it does not engage with				

Kingdon on, for example, the softening process within communities. It largely discusses the potential for policy change during a window of opportunity.

Zahariadis (2004), <i>Journal of Public Policy</i> , 25	UK (in the EU)	Regulation, competition, 1973-2003	High	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis to explain policy change in terms of the coupling of streams.
---	----------------	------------------------------------	------	---

Uses MSA to develop a 'bottom up' explanation of UK policy development in the EU (as part of a special issue examining the EU and policy convergence). Although policy in the EU provides the impetus for policy change, it only happens when three streams come together in the UK: problem (when the Single European Act shifted the definition of competition policy from national to supranational), policy (when civil servants and businesses developed long term policies to integrate UK and EU laws) and politics (when the election of Labour increased receptiveness to policy change).

Zehavi (2008), <i>Comparative Politics</i> , 21	UK & US	The role of faith based voluntary groups in public/ social service delivery, 1980s plus main focus on change from late 1990s	Low	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis, interviews and media analysis to explain policy adoption.
---	---------	--	-----	--

Superficial use of MSA. The biggest discussion of Kingdon's approach is in the conclusion: "Kingdon's garbage can theory of the policy process provides a useful framework for explaining the emergence of the policy: new policies are adopted when the problem stream (social exclusion), policy stream (faith-based initiative), and politics stream (religiously motivated politicians in positions of power) converge". Otherwise, there is no real attempt to operationalise MSA, policy theory or the agenda setting literature.

Zhu (2008), <i>Policy Science</i> , 20	China	Urban policy, detention and repatriation of urban vagrants, 1982 and 2003	High	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis to develop a model to adapt MSA to Chinese policymaking.
--	-------	---	------	--

An important attempt to examine the extent to which a policy theory derived from studies of the US can be used to explain policymaking in China. Focuses broadly on Kingdon's streams,

but specifically on the idea of ‘technical infeasibility’ – the proposal of a politically acceptable solution that cannot be dealt with routinely by the governing bureaucracy, prompting high external and government attention, and potentially major policy change. The case demonstrates that, while some ‘universal’ concepts travel well, they do not tell us much about the policy processes of other countries (in the absence of detailed case studies).

Sub-national studies (13)

Dudley (2013), <i>Journal of European Public Policy</i> , 18	UK, London	Transport, road pricing, London congestion charge, post war plus vignette 2000-3	High	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis and theory-development to explain how actors influence the duration of policy windows.
---	------------	--	------	--

An example of a combination of MSA and theory development to aid case study explanation (or, perhaps in this case, the use of a case to illuminate theoretical claims). Uses the study of policy narratives and persuasion to examine how key policymakers (in this case, the London Mayor) frame issues to open windows of opportunity for policy change. In this case, the Mayor was not only part of the politics stream, but also a key influence of the definition of the problem and the promoter of a well-established solution.

Exworthy and Powell (2004), <i>Public Administration</i> , 19	UK, central-local, implementation	Health, health inequality, late 1990s	Medium	No (yes). Uses interview (45), survey, and documentary analysis to reconceptualise the role of streams in relation to policy implementation (note ‘little’ and ‘big’ windows).
--	-----------------------------------	---------------------------------------	--------	--

Takes MSA as a starting point, but argues for major revisions to reflect a different time (late 1990s) and focus (local, implementation). Focuses on streams, but changes their names or meaning, which makes it difficult to compare with the MSA (beyond the idea that separate processes may need to join together to ensure policy change or success).

Greathouse et al (2005), <i>Policy, Politics, & Nursing Practice</i> , 10	US, Lexington, Kentucky	Public health, tobacco, smoke-free law (vignette)	High	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis and interviews to explain the coupling of streams and policy change.
--	-------------------------	---	------	--

Case study of specific policy change structured and explained in terms of three streams coming together: problem (public attention rose to the problem of secondhand smoking, and the idea that workers should be protected), policies (a well-established smoke-free plan, used in many states and countries) and politics (a pressure group a scientific advocacy plan, aided

by favourable turnover in elected office). No discussion of the broader agenda setting literature or policy theory.

Guldbrandsson and Fossum (2009), <i>Health Promotion International</i> , 11	Sweden (3 issues, 3 municipalities)	Public health, child health promotion	High	No (yes). Uses interviews (50) and documentary analysis to explain the production of policy windows.
---	-------------------------------------	---------------------------------------	------	--

Chooses nine case studies of policy change, tracing back to the confluence of streams during a policy window (in other words, there is no way to pick up on a *lack* of change with this method). The authors refer to a wider literature, and they cite the PET, MSA and John's focus on 5 causal factors as guides for their interview research, but (perhaps because of space limits on the article) with no real sense of how MSA fits into the literature. This case is based on MSA but is difficult to relate to other case studies based on MSA.

Henstra (2010), <i>Canadian Public Administration</i> , 18	Canada, municipal governments	Emergency management (vignette)	High	No (yes). Uses interviews and documentary analysis to explain why policies may change in some municipalities but not others.
--	-------------------------------	---------------------------------	------	--

The case focuses strongly on MSA (with some discussion of the broader agenda setting literature), which guides the structure and analysis of the case study. It demonstrates an unusual role for a policy entrepreneur, in one case, to keep a low-attention issue high enough up the agenda (following a potential emergency, as a focusing event) to produce a form of policy change (investment in emergency equipment). It raises (implicitly, without further analysis) the differences in scale at this level of government (the investment was \$100k) which might affect the nature of each stream and the role of individuals.

Lieberman (2002), <i>Education and Urban Society</i> , 13	US, Chicago	Education, state schools, Chicago School Reform Acts 1988 & 1995	Medium/ Low	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis and interviews (phone and in person) to explain major policy change during a policy window.
---	-------------	--	----------------	---

A very brief case study of education reform which uses MSA in a superficial way to structure and explain: problems (budget deficits, low attainment, a sense of poor leadership), policies (governance reforms) and politics (in terms of the party control of Illinois); with a brief identification of entrepreneurs such as the mayor.

Liu et al (2010), <i>Policy Studies</i>	US, Texas, Florida and	Environment, climate	High	No (yes). Uses interviews (271) and documentary analysis to operationalise and
---	------------------------	----------------------	------	--

<i>Journal</i> , 23	Louisiana	change		code various aspects of agenda setting (in a way not found in most MSA studies).
Explicitly sets out to extend the value of MSA from US federal to US subnational government, to examine comparable agenda setting processes. It resembles a local power study, examining the most important actors, as well as Kingdonesque factors that influence attention (focusing events, budgets, measures of problems, ‘feedback’), the acceptability of solutions (technical, value, future constraints, and <i>compatibility with federal government policy</i>), and receptivity to solutions (coalition building, personnel change, group mobilisation, national/ local mood and <i>issue jurisdiction</i>). Unusually high attention on operationalising agenda setting concepts and identifying locally specific influences on each stream.				
McLendon (2003), <i>Journal of Higher Education</i> , 37	US states	Higher education, history and vignette	High	Cites Sabatier (1999) to argue that MSA ‘has attracted relatively little testing and elaboration’. Uses interview (61) and documentary analysis to compare cases.
The article argues that HE policy in US states resembles the MSA/ garbage can model, which challenges the dominant view in HE that policy change is incremental. It presents a detailed case study before concluding, quite briefly, that MSA provides the best explanation for events. Although less so than Liu et al (2010), it briefly demonstrates the potential distinctiveness of state-level policy making, with the policies stream often involving policy diffusion and learning from other states (something that perhaps makes US studies more comparable to those in the EU).				
Oborn, Barrett, and Exworthy (2011), <i>Public Administration</i> , 20	UK, London	Health, healthcare reform	High	No (yes). Uses interview (51) and documentary analysis to identify the role of a specific policy entrepreneur.
Outlines the MSA briefly then focuses on the role of a policy entrepreneur. Like Dudley (2013) and Henstra (2010), the focus is on an entrepreneur involved, and to a large extent directing, all three streams. The 3 articles highlight the importance of scale, with the potential for a hypothesis along the lines of: ‘the three streams are more independent at the federal or supranational level; at local levels, they are more open to influence by exceptional individuals’. The article also captures a focus in health on evidence-based policymaking, although it contrasts the reliance on evidence in health interventions with the less reliable evidence on healthcare organisation.				
Ridde (2009), <i>Public</i>	Africa, Burkina Faso, local	Healthcare, ‘Bamako	High	No (yes – <u>unusually focused on operationalising MSA with</u>

Administration, 17	policy implementation	initiative' on equitable access to care, from 1987		'research propositions'). Uses in-depth interviews (24), informal interviews (60), focus groups (4), documentary analysis and field observation (7 months).
<p>Considers relevance of MSA to a different country and continent (BF, Africa), and stage of policy (implementation). Tries to produce a series of 'research propositions' which resemble quite-general hypotheses based on the MSA. An example of a case study trying to explain a lack of policy change – at the implementation stage - in terms of the non-coupling of streams and the absence of a successful policy entrepreneur. One potentially important finding (which links to Exworthy & Powell) is that <i>policy can change after coupling during a policy window when only a vague policy solution has been produced and adopted</i>. Consequently, a new process of coupling is required at the local level when a more detailed solution must be found. Exworthy and Powell focused on national-central, whereas Ridde highlights the problem of implementing national policies originating largely from international initiatives (a problem explored in more depth by Cairney and Mamudu, 2014; Cairney, Studlar and Mamudu, 2014).</p>				
Robinson and Eller (2010), <i>Policy Studies Journal</i> , 17	US, Texas	Education and crime, schools, violence prevention	Very high	Yes. Tests one hypothesis on the separation of streams. Uses a survey of participants.
<p>Argues that MSA 'provided a falsifiable account of the policy process - even if it provided no falsifiable predictions about the policy outcomes'. Discusses how to operationalise MSA, identifying Zahariadis' work on bounded rationality (ambiguity and time constraints) and his call for us to work out when MSA does or does not apply. Then, it seeks to test the hypothesis that streams are separate in a meaningful way, with different streams having different participants – e.g. participation in the problem stream suggests a lower probability of participation in the policy stream. The data suggests that the streams are not meaningfully separate. Note that the data is collected at a subnational level, leaving us to wonder if national/ sub-national processes differ. The broader problem is that Kingdon may be arguing that streams <i>can be</i> independent at important moments, which remains a potentially useful but almost unfalsifiable proposition.</p>				
Rossiter and Price (2013), <i>Local Economy</i> , 11	UK	Local economic development in East Midlands, replacement of Regional	High/ medium	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis and 'direct experience' to explain policy change.

		Development agencies with Local Enterprise Partnerships in England		
Looks like a classic, brief, case study approach, identifying 3 streams, entrepreneurs and windows, but the focus is on a largely government-driven process of rejecting the value of RDAs (occupying problem and politics streams) and a lack of capacity in development bodies (combined with ambiguity surrounding government aims) to set out a clear role in economic development.				
Sager and Rielle (2013), <i>Policy Science</i> , 21	Switzerland, cantons	Public health, alcohol policy, 1999-2004	High/medium	No (yes). Attempts to use MSA within a more detailed model of organisational change. Uses documentary analysis and a survey to explain policy adoption in 10/26 cantons.
An unusual case of model development, which takes the garbage can model and turns it into something much more detailed, with a large number of conditions/ independent variables. There is little discussion of MSA, and the three streams do not help structure or explain the results.				
International studies (8)				
Ackrill and Kay (2011), <i>Journal of European Public Policy</i> , 18	European Union (in trade negotiations with other countries)	Agriculture, trade, sugar policy reform, 2005	High	No (yes). Uses interviews and documentary analysis
An example of using the application of MSA to the EU (and its role in the wider world) to foster some conceptual development: to argue that ambiguity extends to not knowing which directorate is responsible for policy (akin to the PET focus on problem definition and venue shopping); and to focus on policy entrepreneurship as an opportunity as well as an individual with skills to exploit it. It also uses the three streams structure to explain how a policy window opened. In broader terms, it takes us from the US domestic process (one of the most studied arenas in the world) to arenas in which our knowledge of the policy process is less clear (see also studies of China, India, Africa).				
Bache (2012), <i>Journal of</i>	European	Wellbeing and quality of	High	No (yes). Uses interviews and

<i>European Public Policy</i> , 18	Union	life measures to compete with GDP		documentary analysis.
Tries to adapt the MSA's broad framework to EU policy processes, using the three streams as a way to guide the analysis, but also highlighting the 'complex overlapping national, European and other international policy networks through which ideas are developed and diffused' (p22). As with other cases, the argument is that the problem stream can develop outside of the jurisdiction under study – something not recognised initially by studies of domestic US policy processes.				
Borrás and Radaelli (2011), <i>Journal of European Public Policy</i> , 22	European Union	Governance reform, economic governance, Lisbon treaty, 2000-10	Medium	No (yes). A largely theoretical and documentary analysis of the development of the Lisbon Treaty, including a brief discussion of MSA.
The article includes a discussion of Kingdon and MSA, but as part of a much wider search for a literature to help explain the development and effect of the Lisbon treaty (an often ambiguous policy combining the reduction of red tape, and pursuit of economic competitiveness, with a focus on sustainable economic development). Unlike most other cases, it does not use the three streams to guide or explain the research, but it does identify the role of entrepreneurs and the general point about streams coming together.				
Copeland and James (2014), <i>Journal of European Public Policy</i> , 19	European Union	Governance reform, economic governance, relaunch of the Lisbon treaty, 2010 (Europe 2020)	Very high	Yes, to some extent. Uses MSA to produce case-specific propositions to explain the policy dynamics regarding the Lisbon treaty. Combines interviews and documentary analysis.
An article with an unusually high focus on operationalising aspects of the MSA, although it refers to 'propositions' rather than hypotheses, and the propositions are still quite broad and, to some extent, case specific. Also contains the use of the three streams to structure the analysis, but with an unusual focus on two simultaneous causes of policy windows: a socioeconomic crisis, providing a window for economic reform, and a political receptiveness to reforming or reintroducing the Lisbon treaty.				
Jordan et al (2003), <i>Public Administration</i> ,	European Union	Environment, 'new' environmental	Medium	No (yes). Provides a brief analysis of MSA as one of several explanations for

20		policy instruments (NEPIs) (the spread of market and voluntary measures)		policy change. Uses interview and documentary analysis.
Compares explanations of policy transfer/ adoption within the EU with reference to ideas-based, institutional, and MSA accounts. There is a limited outline of MSA, which does not guide the structure of the article or analysis, and MSA is there to be the ‘chaos’ explanation alongside a discussion of the pursuit of ideas in the face of institutional constraint.				
Lipson (2007), <i>Global Governance</i> , 19	United Nations	Major policy change – a shift to a peacekeeping role for the UN, 1988-95	High	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis and the MSA structure to explain major change.
The first half examines how the UN can be described using the model of the garbage can, and the second half uses the streams headings to explain policy shifts – problems linked to ethnic conflicts, policies linked to ‘mutating’ ideas about intervention after the Cold War, and receptivity linked to changing attitudes to peacekeeping by the US and Russia – prompted by the opening up of a window, linked to the end of the Cold War, and the role of several entrepreneurs. Unlike studies of the EU or subnational authorities, does not raise distinctive elements of the UN when compared to the US.				
Nowak (2010), <i>West European Politics</i> , 17	European Union	Rulings by the European Court of Justice, free movement of goods	High	No (yes). Uses documentary analysis – a focus on legal proceedings and their effects – to compare cases.
Describes MSA and outlines the resemblance between the EU and garbage can model. Argues that ECJ rulings do not produce an inevitable legislative change by member states of the EU. Rather, they act perhaps as focusing events which grab the attention of policymakers, and policy change requires the role of entrepreneurs to promote one interpretation of the ruling and use it to propose a connected policy solution. Nowak demonstrates this argument by comparing two similar cases: one was ignored by policymakers; the other was used to promote significant policy change. Unlike other studies of the EU, the case does not raise issues about the unusual nature of EU decision-making. Instead, this resembles the classic national studies described to fit the MSA and GC models.				

Sarmiento-Mirwaldt (2013), <i>European Urban and Regional Studies</i> , 15	European Union	Planning, urban policy, 'territorial cohesion', 1989-2008	High	No (yes). It argues that MSA has predictive power (in relation to the role of entrepreneurs) but does not produce hypotheses.
<p>Applies MSA to the EU, taking into account 'multi-level governance', or the diffusion of power across the EU, and therefore some ambiguity (or, at least, uncertainty) about who is responsible for policy. It highlights the development of a policy solution by a wide range of actors, producing quite a large set of vague aims (but all under the umbrella of territorial cohesion and a general desire to introduce a clear EU responsibility for some aspects of planning); policy entrepreneurs were therefore able to seek the right conditions to propose some aspects of territorial cohesion policy.</p>				

ⁱ PAR Public Administration Review; RPR Review of Policy Research; JEPP Journal of European Public Policy;